

PAPER SEMINAR PEER REVIEW FORM

INSTRUCTIONS

Read the paper twice, once to get an overview of the paper, and a second time to provide constructive criticism for the author to use during revisions. Answer the questions below.

ORGANIZATION

1. Were the basic sections (Introduction, Body, Conclusion, References, etc.) included?
If not, what is missing?
2. Did the author use subheadings to clarify the sections of the text?
Could these be better? Explain how.
3. Did the author organize the paper in a way that was logical, clear, and easy to follow?
Explain and offer any suggestions for improvement

CITATIONS

4. Did the author cite sources adequately and appropriately?
Note any incorrect formatting that you see.
5. Were all the citations in the text listed in the References section?
Were all references cited in the text? Note any discrepancies.

GRAMMAR AND STYLE

6. Were there any grammatical or spelling problems? Mark them on the original paper.
7. Was the author's writing style clear? Did the paragraphs connect?
Were sentences cohesive?

CONTENT

8. Did the author have a strong argument? Explain.
9. Did the author use details and examples from appropriate sources?
If no, what's missing?
10. Did the author make some contribution of thought to the paper, or merely summarize other publications? Explain your answer.

GUIDELINES

For Paper Seminar Responses

- Read the document all the way through.
- Point out the strengths as well as the weaknesses of the document.
- Offer suggestions, not commands.
- Editorial comments should be appropriate and constructive.
Be respectful and considerate of the writer's feelings and phrase it in a way that will encourage the author to listen.
- Be sure that your comments are clear and text-specific (for example, terms such as "unclear" or "vague" are too general to be helpful).
You need to tell the author exactly what you mean.
- Raise questions that cross your mind as you read.
- Try not to overwhelm your peer with too much commentary.
Follow the feedback form.
- Be careful not to let your own opinions bias your review.
- Reread your comments before passing them on to your peer.
Make sure all your comments make sense and are easy to follow.
- Avoid turning your peer's paper into your paper.